

Phil 57 section 3
Prof. Stemwedel
Homework #2

Diagram the following arguments. Be sure to assign a number to each claim, and to use “+” to indicate when two (or more) premises are working jointly to support a conclusion.

1. Whatever doesn't kill me makes me stronger. The amount of coffee I drink is a lot, but it hasn't killed me. So all that coffee makes me stronger.

2. Time is either real or unreal. Space is real. Time cannot be separated from space. If something is real, and another thing cannot be separated from it, then that thing must also be real. So, time is real.

3. Jewish dietary law defines as “kosher” only meat from particular kinds of animals. Mammals that have cloven hooves and that chew their cud can be kosher, but mammals missing one of these two are not. (So rabbits, which ruminates but don't have hooves, are not kosher.) Fish must have both fins and scales to be kosher. Milk and meat must not be consumed in the same kosher meal. (Fish don't count as meat or dairy in this reckoning.) All of this means that the **Aigi Kampoi** (a fish-tailed goat of folklore) would be kosher because it has cloven hooves, chews its cud, and has fins and scales. However, it would still be considered a meat meal, even though it's partially fish. So you can't eat dairy with it.

4. If morality requires freedom, and punishment requires morality, it follows that punishment requires freedom.

5. God is all-powerful, all-loving, and all-knowing. Since God is all-powerful, he has the capacity to rid the world of evil. Since God is all-knowing, he has the capacity to know where and when evil occurs. Since God is all loving, he wants to get rid of evil in the world. However, there is evil in the world. Thus, God does not exist.

6. Some things that exist are caused by other things. Nothing can be the cause of itself. Nor can there be an endless string of objects causing other objects to exist. Therefore, there must be an uncaused first cause: God.

7. If I don't give out add codes to everyone who wants one, I'm going to make some people who want to add the course mad at me. If I do give out add codes to everyone who wants one, I'll go over the enrollment target, which will make my department chair mad at me. This means whatever I do, someone is going to be mad at me.

8. In *Star Wars (Episode IV: A New Beginning)*, Darth Vader boards Princess Leia's ship and has the following conversation with a member of the crew:

Vader: Where are those transmissions you intercepted?

Rebel: We intercepted no transmissions. This is a consular ship. We're on a diplomatic mission.

Vader: If this is a consular ship, where is the ambassador?

Rewrite Darth Vader's argument, and diagram it.

9. In the film *Monty Python and the Holy Grail*, the following dialogue takes place between King Arthur and a soldier with a keen interest in birds:

1st soldier with a keen interest in birds: Where'd you get the coconuts?

King Arthur: We found them.

1st soldier with a keen interest in birds: Found them? In Mercia? The coconut's tropical!

King Arthur: What do you mean?

1st soldier with a keen interest in birds: Well, this is a temperate zone

King Arthur: The swallow may fly south with the sun or the house martin or the plover may seek warmer climes in winter, yet these are not strangers to our land?

1st soldier with a keen interest in birds: Are you suggesting coconuts migrate?

King Arthur: Not at all. They could be carried.

1st soldier with a keen interest in birds: What? A swallow carrying a coconut?

King Arthur: It could grip it by the husk!

1st soldier with a keen interest in birds: It's not a question of where he grips it! It's a simple question of weight ratios! A five ounce bird could not carry a one pound coconut.

Rewrite King Arthur's argument, and diagram it. Then rewrite the soldier's argument, and diagram it.

Important note: *Future homework problems will appear on the course website and in the course D2L shell at least 48 hours before the class meeting in which we work on them. Please print them out and bring them with you to class (or be prepared to access them electronically during class).*

<http://sjsu.desire2learn.com>

<http://www.stemwedel.org/logic-and-critical-reasoning/homework>